# Index

Adams, John, 195 Administrative Appeals Tribunal establishment of, 185 Administrative law exceptionalism of Australian, 176, 185 iudicial review see Iudicial review new constitutional, 185 United Kingdom, in, 177-8 Adversarial system truth and, 229, 235-8 civil law inquisitorial systems and, 241-8 Alder J, 189 Alexy, Robert, 189 Allan, Trevor, 180, 186 Allison, JWF, 180 Anderson Legal, 13 Appeal Australian courts, to Judicial Committee of Privy Council from, 260 Australia judicial review, Australian solutions, 184 - 8New Zealand and, shared tradition, 177 Bacon, Francis, 233-4 Bar independent and competent, and public administration of justice, 1-3, 7-17 modern, state of, 1-3, 7-17 Multi Disciplinary Practices, impact on, 3, 12 - 15technology, emerging, impact on, 2-3, 11 - 2Barwick, Sir Garfield, 49 Bennett, David AC QC, 5, 175 Solicitor-General, as Commonwealth, 218 2010 Sir Maurice Byers Lecture, delivery by, 218-28 Bills of attainder retroactive laws and, 34-6

Blackburn, Justice Richard, 49 Brennan, Hon Sir Gerard Brennan AC KBE, 175

legalism, strict, and Brennan Court, 56-8 Bybee, IS torture, and memorandum justifying, 175, 2.32 Byers, Sir Maurice CBE QC, 60, 102-3, 175, 195, 217, 260 advocacy of, 74, 230 excellence in, 23, 48 Australian Constitutional Commission, chairman of, 24, 107, 195, 260 Bar Association Annual Report 1982, 280-3 barrister, as quintessential, 1, 4-5 Bench and Bar Dinner 1994, speech given at, 292-9 career, distinguished, 4, 23 constitutional vision, 195-7 eulogy, 300-3 judiciary, advocate's view of, 284-91 obituary, by Tom Hughes, 304-5 Solicitor-General of Commonwealth, as, 91, 98, 107, 282 stature of, 133-6 Cab-rank rule, 10, 14-5 Canada judicial review, unreasonableness as standard of, 187 Cane, Peter, 185 Certiorari non-jurisdictional error of law, availability to correct, 183 Chevron doctrine, 100-2 Choper, Professor Jesse, 209 Civil law inquisitorial systems, adversarial systems and, 241-8 Common law Australia, single common law of, 194 rights, statute law and, 88, 96 Commonwealth federal balance, 212-6 legislative power, broad reach of, 212-3

### THE BYERS LECTURES

Commonwealth (cont) States and institutional functionaries, as, 206 responsibilities, overlap between, 211 Constitution Chap III, Judicature, 24-5 detention, right to freedom from, 20, 21, 38-9 equal application of federal law, right to, 20, 22, 39-41 usurpation of judicial power, right to protection from, 20-1, 32-8 due process entrenchment of procedural rights guaranteeing, 19-21, 25-8 procedural protections afforded by, 19.25-6procedural right, definition, 19 substantive rights, distinction, 25-6 substantive, 42 substantive rights, recognition or protection of, 20, 30-41 top-down legal reasoning and, 79-80 Chap IV, Finance and Trade, 127 Chap V, States, 127 conventions, constitutional, 107-8 evolving concepts in, 46 federal constitutionalism, 98 federation, statement of purpose of, 203 fundamental constitutional doctrines, assumption in, 72 interpretation, constitutional, 44-65 foundation document, where judicially enforceable written constitutions, 44 legalism, strict, 45, 169-71, 201-2 Brennan Court, 56-8 Dixon Court, 50-2 Gleeson Court, 58-63 Mason Court, 52-5 policy-oriented court, and, 63-5 Jubilee of Australian Constitution, celebration of, 207 judicial power constitutionally derived constraint, as, 192 deference, judicial, giving way to judicial vigilance, 214-6

legislative power, broad reach of Commonwealth, 212-3 political system accountability, political, and constitutional means of restraining governmental power, 211 cardinal features, 204 precedent, and doctrine of, 216 responsible government, and meaning at end of 19th century, 205 Royal Assent to, 260 structure and function, vision of, and development premised on, 191-217 elements, critical, of structure, 204 political accountability, text and structure of Constitution and fundamental premise of, 192 resolutions of Australasian Federation Conference of 1890 and, 203 theories of interpretation, 129-71 ambulatory words, 146-7 centre, circle and, 150-2 common law approach, 169 connotation, detonation and, 145-6 core, penumbra and, 150-2 evolutionary nature of legal expressions, 147 expansive construction of powers, not prohibitions, 168-9 founders, and actual intentions of, 152-4 interpretivists, 97-9 literalism, theory of, 169-71 living force, Constitution as, 156-8 living tree, Constitution as, 158-9 modern conditions, workable Constitution in, 163-5 1900 meaning, essential and nonessential elements of, 147-50 non-originalist theories, 129, 154-68 thoughts on, 165 originalist theories, 129, 136-54, 191, 199-201 slavery, generality of language as means of avoiding, 160-3 textual, and strict, 169-71 trial, Constitutional guarantee of right to fair, 28-30

United States, interpretation of prohibition of cruel and unusual punishment, 44 Control orders striking down, 20-1 Conventions constitutional, 107-8 Cooke, Sir Robin, 184, 186 unreasonableness, approach to, 187 Co-operative federalism, 62 Courts Australian, appeals to Judicial Committee of Privy Council from, 260 federal, implied prohibition on State jurisdiction being vested in, 120 parliament and, presumption governing relationship between, 89 Craig, Paul, 180, 188 Davis, Kenneth Culp, 177-8 De Smith, SA, 172, 177 judicial review, description of scope, 178 Deakin, Alfred, 61 Detention Constitution, Chapter III and substantive right to freedom from, 20, 21, 38-9 immigration, 21-2 involuntary detention rule, and Kruger v Commonwealth, 39 Dicey, 61, 70, 180, 186 Dixon, Sir Owen, 70, 75-6, 175, 198, 287 legalism, strict, and, 45, 50-2, 64, 68 section 92 Constitution, view of, 73 truth seeking, view of, 233-4, 239, 248 Drafting legislative, process of, 89 Due process Constitution Chapter III and entrenchment of procedural rights guaranteeing, 19-21, 25-8 substantive, 42 Dworkin, Ronald, 180 Eldon, Lord, 17 Elias, Rt Hon Dame Sian, 172 2008 Sir Maurice Byers Lecture, delivery by, 172-90 Ely, Professor John Hart, 209-10

Equality Constitution Chapter III, and right to equal application of federal law, 20, 22, 39-41 Eskridge, William, 181, 189 European Convention on Human Rights European Court of Human Rights, distinc tion from European Court of Justice, 256 European Union, accession to, 258 living instrument, as, 262 ratification by United Kingdom, 256, 261 signatories to, 256 style, civilian, 258 threat of withdrawal of United Kingdom from, 259 European Court of Human Rights European Court of Justice, distinction from, 256 jurisdiction, 258 European Union European Coal and Steel Commission as first incarnation of, 257 European Court of Justice, jurisdiction, 2.57 - 8Evans, Gareth MP, 5-7 Evidence archaic law of, 239-41 eyewitness testimony, research on, 251-2 Ewens, Mr QC, 91-2 Executive power aliens, and power to prevent entry of, 106 High Court, limits placed on exercise of, 193 implications, and powers deriving from Commonwealth's existence as a polity, 126 Extrinsic materials use of, 99-100 utility of, 89 Federalism constitutionalism, federal, 98 politics of, 207 state jurisdiction, implied prohibition on being vested in federal courts, 120 United States Constitution, and design of, 208

## THE BYERS LECTURES

Federalism (cont) working, and existence of States as governmental entities, 208-9 Fees contingency, public policy and, 2 Fredman, Sandra, 181 Free speech right, 106 responsible government, implication from doctrine of, 70-1 Freedom of communication implied, on political and government matters, 123-5 responsible government, and efficacy of system of, 70-1 Freedom of information legislation administrative reforms and, 182 French, Chief Justice legalism, strict, and High Court of, 45 Gageler, Hon Justice Stephen, 191 Solicitor-General, appointment as Commonwealth, 191 2009 Sir Maurice Byers Lecture, delivery by, 191-217 Gibbs, Sir Harry, 6, 49 Gleeson, Chief Justice, 7, 10 legalism, strict, and Gleeson court, 45, 58-63 Grav, Rachel, 68 Griffith, Chief Justice judicial power, definition by, 25 Gummow, Hon Justice WMC AC, 6, 88 2005 Sir Maurice Byers Lecture, delivery by, 88-106 Harlow, Carol, 186 Hart, Professor HLA, 218, 221 Heydon, Hon Justice JD AC, 129 2007 Sir Maurice Byers Lecture, delivery by, 129-71 High theory middle theory and, 81 History legislative, relevance of, 89 Hoffman, Lord, 14 Hughes, Tom, 4 obituary by, 304-5 Human dignity, 182 concept of, 180

Human rights European Convention on Human Rights European Court of Human Rights, distinction from European Court of Justice, 256 European Union, accession to, 258 living instrument, as, 262 ratification by United Kingdom, 256, 261 signatories to, 256 style, civilian, 258 threat of withdrawal of United Kingdom from, 259 European Court of Human Rights European Court of Justice, distinction from, 256 jurisdiction, 258 Human Rights Act decisions of Strasbourg Court, and requirement to take into account, 262 - 79introduction of, 261 Iconoclasm meaning, 220 Immigration detention, 21-2 Implications, 70-2 assumptions and, 73, 78 Australian constitutional law, theories of implication in, 111 conceptual, 104 constitution, of, 104-28 characteristics, 108-11 definition, 107 interpretation of constitution, and principles of, 125 judicial power, from nature of, 121 responsible government, implication from doctrine of, 70-1 rule of law, possible implications arising from, 121-2 structural, 104, 114-20 textual and, distinction, 71 textual, 104, 114 State jurisdiction, implied prohibition on being vested in federal courts, 120 structural, distinction, 71

Interpretation Constitution, of, 132 ambiguity, and need for, 145 Australasian Federal Convention, and Official Record of Debates of. 141 - 5extrinsic materials, 141-5 history and meaning, relationship between, 140-1 O'Connor J, approach to, 136-7 private law theory, identical, of construction, 137-8 statutory principles of construction and, 138-9 heads of Commonwealth power, concerning, 108 implications, and principles of interpreta tion of constitution, 125 literalistic approach to construction, and purposive approach, 226 purposive, use of, 89, 92 theories of constitutional, 129-71 ambulatory words, 146-7 centre, circle and, 150-2 common law approach, 169 connotation, detonation and, 145-6 core, penumbra and, 150-2 evolutionary nature of legal expressions, 147 expansive construction of powers, not prohibitions, 168-9 founders, and actual intentions of, 152 - 4literalism, theory of, 169-71 living force, Constitution as, 156-8 living tree, Constitution as, 158-9 modern conditions, workable Constitution in, 163-5 1900 meaning, essential and nonessential elements of, 147-50 non-originalist theories, 129, 154-68 thoughts on, 165 originalist theories, 129, 136-54 slavery, generality of language as means of avoiding, 160-3 textual, and strict, 169-71

involuntary detention rule, 39 Ipp, Justice David, 249, 253 Jackson, DF QC, 104 2006 Sir Maurice Byers Lecture, delivery bv. 104-6 Iudicature administrative decisions, power to review for jurisdictional error, 19-21, 45-6 bias, disgualification for, 19 Constitution Chap III, 24-5 judicial power Commonwealth, of, 24 definition, 24-5, 28, 31 exercise, control of, 28 implications from nature of, 121 reasons, requirement to provide, 19 Iudicial review Australian solutions, 184-8 centrality, in pluralistic society, 172 certiorari, availability to correct nonjurisdictional error of law, 183 challenges ahead, 188-90 culture wars and, 189 illogicality as separate ground for, 174 irrationality as separate ground for, 174 iurisdictional error, 174 justification, and culture of, 179 legality, 185 merits review and, maintaining distinction, 182 policy and facts and, distinction, 186 regard to principle of, 173-4 legitimate expectations, and concept of, 174 merits review establishment of system, 185 legality and, maintaining distinction, 182 natural justice, 179 political process, and primacy of, 210 procedural fairness, 174 proportionality analysis, 187 substantive review, developing standards for. 186 substantive unfairness and concept of, 174 ultra vires rationale, 179 unreasonableness as standard of, 187

Iurisdiction constitutional, power of State to confer on Privy Council, 120 State, implied prohibition on being vested in federal courts, 120 Iurv right to trial on indictment by, 26, 46 Justice blind, 254-5 business of, and public administration of, 1 - 3unjust application, 221 Kable doctrine, 20-1, 24, 36-8, 45, 48, 69, 79, 104 Kirk, Dr Jeremy, 55 Koh, Dean Harold, 175 Law role of, played in pluralistic societies, 181 social conditions, mediation and explanation, 182 Legal representation implied right to, 28-30 Legalism, 201-2 strict, 45, 169-71, 201-2 Legality judicial review and, 185 merits review and, maintaining distinction, 182 policy and facts and, distinction, 186 regard to principle of, 173-4 Litigation funding public policy and, 2 Loftus, Elizabeth, 253-4 Macaulay, Thomas Babington, 50 MacCormick, Neil, 181, 182 Mason, Sir Anthony, 7, 287 eulogy by, 300-3 legalism, strict, and Mason Court, 45, 52-5,68 Mason, Justice Keith AC, 66-90 2003-2004 Sir Maurice Byers lecture, delivery by, 66-90, 180 McClellan, Justice Peter, 231, 249, 253 McCullough, David, 195 McHugh, Justice MH AC career, 18

2001 Sir Maurice Byers Lecture, delivery bv. 18-43. 64 Memory truth and facts lost by reason of, 248-54 problems with, 250-1 Merits review establishment of system, 185 legality and, maintaining distinction, 182 Mitchell, Dame Roma, 286 Multi Disciplinary Practices Bar, impact on, 3, 12-5 Natural justice, 179 New Zealand Australia and, shared tradition, 177 Bill of Rights, and equality before the law, 188 judicial review proportionality analysis, 187 substantive fairness, 188 unreasonableness as standard of, 187 Maori, litigation by, 181 O'Connor, Justice, 134-5 constitutional interpretation, approach to, 136 - 7Parliament courts and, presumption governing relationship between, 89 legislative judgement, 32-6 parliamentary sovereignty, sacrosanct nature of, 174 State legislatures, and power for review for jurisdictional error, 193 usurpation of judicial power by, 20-8, 32 bills of attainder, retroactive laws and, 34-6 Kable doctrine, 20-1, 24, 36-8 Partridge, Percy Herbert, 207-9, 211 Pearce, Senator George, 134-5 Perkins, Charlie, 229 Politics judicial review, and primacy of political process, 210 Pollock, Sir Frederick, 95-8 Poole, Thomas, 189 Posner, Richard, 182, 201

#### INDEX

bottom-up reasoning, explanation of, 73-4,82-5 top-down legal reasoning, formulation by, 66-7 Pro bono work, 9-10 Procedural fairness, 174 Procedural protections Constitution, afforded by Chapter III, 19, 25-6procedural right, definition, 19 substantive rights, distinction, 25-6 Purposivism purposive interpretation, use of, 89, 92 Reasons requirement to give, and administrative reforms, 182 Responsible government federation, and meaning at end of 19th century, 205 sovereignty, and importance of, 205-6 Robertson, Alan, 6 Rose, Dennis, 61 Rule of law implications, possible, arising from, 121-2 Rules ambiguity inherent in, 218 certainty, 222-6 exceptions, loyalty to generalisations and recognition of, 228 judicial discretion, and presence of, 219 legal, open texture of, 218 rigidity, and normative, 222 Sawer, Professor Geoffrey, 207 Schauer, Frederick, 227 Separation of powers Commonwealth, of, 127 Simos, QC, 6 Smyth, Jack QC, 18 Spigelman, Chief Justice AC, 5, 175 adversary system, changing view of, 229 career of, 229 Chap V, Constitution, 127 Commonwealth and institutional functionaries, as, 206 responsibilities, overlap between, 211 constitutional jurisdiction, power to confer on Privy Council, 120

existence, continued, and functioning, implications as to, 122-3 federal balance, 212-6 importance, relative, since federation, 123 jurisdiction, implied prohibition on being vested in federal courts, 120 Statute law, 88-105 case law, primacy over, 88, 95-8 certainty, 222-4 common law rights and, 88, 96 construction of statutes, law as mechanism for dealing with problems, 225-6 finding the statute, 93-4 general purposive legislation, as mechanism for dealing with problems of, 224 government policy, reduction to legislative form, 92-3 regulations, changing decision maker, 224 rigidity, and normative, 222 unreasonable applications of law, and filters for dealing with, 225 Steyn, Lord, 14, 88 Substantive review developing standards for, 186 Substantive rights Constitution, recognition or protection by Chapter III, 20, 30-41 detention, right to freedom from, 20, 21, 38-9 equal application of federal law, right to, 20, 22, 39-41 usurpation of judicial power, right to protection from, 20-1, 32-8 Suffrage universal adult, guarantee of, 104-5 Sunstein, Cass, 189 Supreme Courts State constitutional courts, position as, 193 implications concerning existence of, 104-5, 120-1 Susskind, Professor RE, 11-2 Syllogism meaning, 220-1 Taggart, Michael, 172-3, 185, 186

## THE BYERS LECTURES

Technology emerging, impact on Bar, 2-3, 11-2 Top-down legal reasoning, 69-87 Australian legal discourse, entry into, 69 bottom-up reasoning, explanation of, 73-4 constitutional discourse, as part of, 75 Posner, formulation by, 66-7 proscription of concept, 73 Torture memorandum justifying, 175 Trial fair, Constitutional guarantee of right to, 28-30 Tribe, Professor Lawrence, 215-6 Truth adversarial system and, 229, 235-8 civil law inquisitorial systems and, 241 - 8civil law jurisdictions, and inquisitorial systems of, 241-8 common law exclusionary rules and, 230 finding, restrictions on, 239-41 justice, and principles of, 229 law and, 229-55 memory facts lost by reason of, 248-54 problems with, 250-1

perception, plasticity of, 248-50 real, perceived truth and, 231 seeking, significance of, 238-9 United Kingdom administrative law in, 177-8 Human Rights Act decisions of Strasbourg Court, and requirement to take into account, 262-79 introduction of, 261 judicial review, unreasonableness as standard of, 187 Supreme Court, creation of, 260 United Nations Charter, 261 Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 261 Unreasonableness judicial review, as standard of, 187 Vidal, Gore, 238-9 Wade, Professor William, 177-8, 183 Weinrib, Lorraine, 183, 187 Weschler, Professor Herbert, 208-10 Wheeler, Dr Fiona, 33 Whitlam, Prime Minister Gough, 229 government, 98, 107 Winterton, Professor, 30, 42 Woolf, Lord, 11 Wynes, Professor Anstey, 197 Zines, Professor Leslie AO, 28, 44